

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
From: Matthew, Dayna
Sent: Thur 2/5/2015 4:56:32 PM
Subject: FW: REACH - do you know or can you tell if NC DENR is a recipient of USDA financial assistance?

Is there a quick way for me to answer this question about whether NC DENR is a USDA recipient?

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Thursday, February 05, 2015 11:23 AM
To: Farrell, Ericka; Covington, Jeryl
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Dorka, Lilian; Matthew, Dayna
Subject: REACH - do you know or can you tell if NC DENR is a recipient of USDA financial assistance?

Need to know ASAP. Just need to consider/rule out referral or joint investigation.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

To: Matthew, Dayna[Matthew.Dayna@epa.gov]
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Martinez, Brittany[Martinez.Brittany@epa.gov]; O'Lone, Mary[o'lonemary@epa.gov]
From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Sent: Sat 3/7/2015 2:46:51 AM
Subject: Re: To Do List from Today's REACH Meeting

Haven't received RFIs. If they're ready, you can forward to GWEN and John for their info and any input that they have while sharing what I told GWEN today. That is, it'll good on the ADR front and we want to be ready to issue the RFIs in the event ADR isn't a go. Thanks. Velveta

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 6, 2015, at 3:05 PM, Matthew, Dayna <Matthew.Dayna@epa.gov> wrote:

All,

This is the "to-do" list from today's meeting. Please let me know if I've missed or mistaken anything below. It was my error not to invite Brittany to meeting – she is Acting today for Helena. I'm still learning. Thanks very much

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Dayna

Dayna Bowen Matthew

Senior Advisor to Director Office of Civil Rights

Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Room 2524B

Washington, D.C. 20460

Tel: 202-564-9621

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Lapierre, Kenneth[Lapierre.Kenneth@epa.gov]
Cc: HALIM-CHESTNUT, NAIMA[Halim-Chestnut.Naima@epa.gov]; Chang, Patrick[Chang.Patrick@epa.gov]; Packard, Elise[Packard.Elise@epa.gov]
From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Fri 9/5/2014 3:19:09 PM
Subject: FW: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

FYI – OCR is taking the lead on responding to this request. We will work with OGC on the responses.

I will keep you updated throughout the day.

Helena

From: Lee, Monica
Sent: Friday, September 05, 2014 10:19 AM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: FW: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Hi Helena – do you have any information on Earthjustice's complaint to EPA alleging civil rights violations at North Carolina hog farms? Politico is asking if we have a timeline to respond to these petitions, so at the very least we'd want to get back to them on that.

Let me know – thanks!

From: Purchia, Liz
Sent: Thursday, September 04, 2014 4:53 PM
To: Lee, Monica; Allen, Laura
Subject: FW: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

FYI this happened today. Politico Pro's ag edition apparently wrote on it and now the News & Observer is asking.

Laura – Can you check with the region to see if they've gotten incoming and have a response.

Monica – Can you check with OCR on this?

Looks like they're asking us to investigate.

Politico is asking if we have a timeline to respond to these petitions.

Liz Purchia

Press Secretary

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Direct: 202-564-6691

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

From: Davis, Alison

Sent: Thursday, September 04, 2014 4:49 PM

To: Purchia, Liz

Subject: Fwd: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

see below. This includes the group's press release

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Murawski, John" <jmurawski@newsobserver.com>

Date: September 4, 2014 at 4:35:36 PM EDT

To: Alison Davis <Davis.Alison@epamail.epa.gov>, "Davis, Alison"
<davis.alison@epa.gov>

Subject: Fwd: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Alison,

Greetings. I'm writing a short item about this Earthjustice complaint to EPA alleging civil rights violations at NC hog farms. The complaint is filed with EPA and against DENR.

Can you tell me if you've received such complaints before based on civil rights law, if not against hog farms than other industrial operations, or if this is the first of its kind. I'm trying to put this in context if possible. Also, would EPA decide this by paperwork or would there be hearings, testimony, evidence?

I look forward to hearing from you.

John Murawski

Staff Writer

The News & Observer

Raleigh, NC

Tel: 919-829-8932

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Fax: 829-4529

e-mail: john.murawski@newsobserver.com

Twitter: @johnmurawski

Visit our blog: <http://www.newsobserver.com/bizblog/>

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE

September 4, 2014 (7.00 am)

Contacts

Devon Hall, Sr.|Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help| [910.296.1180](tel:910.296.1180)

Naeema Muhammad| North Carolina Environmental Justice Network|[252.314.0703](tel:252.314.0703)

Larry Baldwin | Waterkeeper Alliance | lbaldwin@waterkeeper.org | [252.670.1413](tel:252.670.1413)

Marianne Engelman Lado | Earthjustice

| mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org | [212.845.7376](tel:212.845.7376) x 7393

Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Decade-long struggle with North Carolina over public health shifts to the EPA as
community groups state lax oversight of hog operations violates civil rights

WARSAW, N.C.—The North Carolina Environmental Justice Network, Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help and Waterkeeper Alliance, supported by Earthjustice, filed a complaint with the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Office of Civil Rights under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 alleging that North Carolina's lax regulation of hog waste disposal discriminates against communities of color in eastern North Carolina.

The complaint is the latest chapter in a longstanding struggle to address the community health impacts posed by massive amounts of fecal waste from industrial hog facilities. Community members have repeatedly asked the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) for stronger protections, but are now seeking help from the EPA, stating that a recent decision by DENR to issue a permit that will cover thousands of hog facilities without adequate waste disposal controls violates federal law and civil rights.

“Rural eastern North Carolinians, especially poor people and people of color, continue to suffer from the horrible conditions brought on by the industrial hog industry” said **Naeema Muhammad, Director of North Carolina Environmental Justice Network**. “It’s the State’s job to regulate these operations and make sure that the people and the environment are protected. This complaint is about making sure they do that.”

The permit continues to allow industry to flush hog feces and urine into open, unlined pits and then to spray this “liquid manure” onto nearby fields. This practice leads to waste contaminating nearby waters. The waste also drifts as mist onto neighboring properties, causing unbearable odors. The impact is worsened by the growth of the poultry industry in the state and the piles of chicken waste that often sit uncovered on fields for days on end.

These operations are disproportionately located in communities of color where neighbors are forced to endure the smell, water quality impacts and the embarrassment associated with the facilities operating near their homes.

"You can't imagine what it's like to live next to one of these hog operations," said **Devon Hall, Project Manager at the Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help (REACH)**. "It's hard to enjoy the outdoors and it's embarrassing to invite company over, because the flies and the smells make life miserable. We've complained for decades about it."

"The negative impacts that hog operations have on the environment and neighboring communities is outrageous, and the government is turning a blind eye to those in harm's way," said **Larry Baldwin, Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO) Coordinator at Waterkeeper Alliance**. "It's time the State took its responsibility to protect the citizens of North Carolina seriously. After years of working to improve water quality in the eastern portion of the state, I can say that it's time for the state to take action."

The complainants have notified officials at DENR and EPA of the filing and are asking EPA to initiate an investigation.

LINK TO FILED COMPLAINT: <http://waterkeeper.org/cms/assets/uploads/2014/09/North-Carolina-EJ-Network-et-al-Complaint-under-Title-VI.pdf>

#

About NCEJN

The North Carolina Environmental Justice Network is a statewide, grassroots-led non-profit organization made up of community members and other organizations that work to fight environmental injustice. The EJ Network seeks to promote health and environmental

equality for all people of North Carolina through organizing, advocacy, research, and education based on principles of economic equity and democracy for all people. The EJ Network supports the communities that are most impacted by environmental injustice and has worked for nearly two decades to change the fact that industrial swine facilities in North Carolina are allowed to pollute low-income communities and communities of color.

About REACH

The Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help strives to improve the quality of life for families and people of color in rural eastern North Carolina. In particular, REACH addresses social, economic and environmental issues through its environmental awareness, sustainable agriculture, small business development, and homeownership programs.

About WATERKEEPER® Alliance

Founded in 1999 by environmental attorney and activist Robert F. Kennedy, Jr. and several veteran Waterkeeper Organizations, Waterkeeper Alliance is a global movement of on-the-water advocates who patrol and protect over 1.5 million square miles of rivers, streams and coastlines in North and South America, Europe, Australia, Asia and Africa. Learn more at: www.waterkeeper.org or follow @Waterkeeper on Twitter and Facebook.

About Earthjustice

Earthjustice, the nation's premier nonprofit environmental law organization, wields the power of law and the strength of partnership to protect people's health, to preserve magnificent places and wildlife, to advance clean energy and to combat climate change.

Because the earth needs a good lawyer.

To: Lee, Monica[Lee.Monica@epa.gov]
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Ali, Mustafa[Ali.Mustafa@epa.gov]; Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]; Chang, Patrick[Chang.Patrick@epa.gov]; Packard, Elise[Packard.Elise@epa.gov]; Covington, Jeryl[Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov]
From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Fri 9/5/2014 3:16:59 PM
Subject: RE: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Hi Monica-

Thanks for the email below. I will work to prepare a response to the press questions below. Is there a deadline?

Helena

From: Lee, Monica
Sent: Friday, September 05, 2014 10:19 AM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: FW: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Hi Helena – do you have any information on Earthjustice’s complaint to EPA alleging civil rights violations at North Carolina hog farms? Politico is asking if we have a timeline to respond to these petitions, so at the very least we’d want to get back to them on that.

Let me know – thanks!

From: Purchia, Liz
Sent: Thursday, September 04, 2014 4:53 PM
To: Lee, Monica; Allen, Laura
Subject: FW: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

FYI this happened today. Politico Pro's ag edition apparently wrote on it and now the News & Observer is asking.

Laura – Can you check with the region to see if they've gotten incoming and have a response.

Monica – Can you check with OCR on this?

Looks like they're asking us to investigate.

Politico is asking if we have a timeline to respond to these petitions.

Liz Purchia

Press Secretary

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Direct: 202-564-6691

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

From: Davis, Alison

Sent: Thursday, September 04, 2014 4:49 PM

To: Purchia, Liz

Subject: Fwd: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

see below. This includes the group's press release

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Murawski, John" <jmurawski@newsobserver.com>

Date: September 4, 2014 at 4:35:36 PM EDT

To: Alison Davis <Davis.Alison@epamail.epa.gov>, "Davis, Alison" <davis.alison@epa.gov>

Subject: Fwd: Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Alison,

Greetings. I'm writing a short item about this Earthjustice complaint to EPA alleging civil rights violations at NC hog farms. The complaint is filed with EPA and against DENR.

Can you tell me if you've received such complaints before based on civil rights law, if not against hog farms than other industrial operations, or if this is the first of its kind. I'm trying to put this in context if possible. Also, would EPA decide this by paperwork or would there be hearings, testimony, evidence?

I look forward to hearing from you.

John Murawski

Staff Writer

The News & Observer

Raleigh, NC

Tel: 919-829-8932

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Fax: 829-4529

e-mail: john.murawski@newsobserver.com

Twitter: @johnmurawski

Visit our blog: <http://www.newsobserver.com/bizblog/>

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE

September 4, 2014 (7.00 am)

Contacts

Devon Hall, Sr.|Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help| [910.296.1180](tel:910.296.1180)

Naeema Muhammad| North Carolina Environmental Justice Network|[252.314.0703](tel:252.314.0703)

Larry Baldwin | Waterkeeper Alliance | lbaldwin@waterkeeper.org | [252.670.1413](tel:252.670.1413)

Marianne Engelman Lado | Earthjustice

| mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org | 212.845.7376 x 7393

Jonathan Hahn|Caplan Communications| jonathan@caplancommunications.com | 301-998-6592

Community Groups Petition EPA for Precedent Setting Case on Civil Rights Violations

Decade-long struggle with North Carolina over public health shifts to the EPA as
community groups state lax oversight of hog operations violates civil rights

WARSAW, N.C.—The North Carolina Environmental Justice Network, Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help and Waterkeeper Alliance, supported by Earthjustice, filed a complaint with the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Office of Civil Rights under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 alleging that North Carolina's lax regulation of hog waste disposal discriminates against communities of color in eastern North Carolina.

The complaint is the latest chapter in a longstanding struggle to address the community health impacts posed by massive amounts of fecal waste from industrial hog facilities. Community members have repeatedly asked the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) for stronger protections, but are now seeking help from the EPA, stating that a recent decision by DENR to issue a permit that will cover thousands of hog facilities without adequate waste disposal controls violates federal law and civil rights.

"Rural eastern North Carolinians, especially poor people and people of color, continue to suffer from the horrible conditions brought on by the industrial hog industry" said **Naeema Muhammad, Director of North Carolina Environmental Justice Network**. "It's the State's job to regulate these operations and make sure that the people and the environment are protected. This complaint is about making sure they do that."

The permit continues to allow industry to flush hog feces and urine into open, unlined pits and then to spray this "liquid manure" onto nearby fields. This practice leads to waste contaminating nearby waters. The waste also drifts as mist onto neighboring properties, causing unbearable odors. The impact is worsened by the growth of the poultry industry in

the state and the piles of chicken waste that often sit uncovered on fields for days on end.

These operations are disproportionately located in communities of color where neighbors are forced to endure the smell, water quality impacts and the embarrassment associated with the facilities operating near their homes.

"You can't imagine what it's like to live next to one of these hog operations," said **Devon Hall, Project Manager at the Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help (REACH)**. "It's hard to enjoy the outdoors and it's embarrassing to invite company over, because the flies and the smells make life miserable. We've complained for decades about it."

"The negative impacts that hog operations have on the environment and neighboring communities is outrageous, and the government is turning a blind eye to those in harm's way," said **Larry Baldwin, Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO) Coordinator at Waterkeeper Alliance**. "It's time the State took its responsibility to protect the citizens of North Carolina seriously. After years of working to improve water quality in the eastern portion of the state, I can say that it's time for the state to take action."

The complainants have notified officials at DENR and EPA of the filing and are asking EPA to initiate an investigation.

LINK TO FILED COMPLAINT: <http://waterkeeper.org/cms/assets/uploads/2014/09/North-Carolina-EJ-Network-et-al-Complaint-under-Title-VI.pdf>

#

About NCEJN

The North Carolina Environmental Justice Network is a statewide, grassroots-led non-profit organization made up of community members and other organizations that work to fight

environmental injustice. The EJ Network seeks to promote health and environmental equality for all people of North Carolina through organizing, advocacy, research, and education based on principles of economic equity and democracy for all people. The EJ Network supports the communities that are most impacted by environmental injustice and has worked for nearly two decades to change the fact that industrial swine facilities in North Carolina are allowed to pollute low-income communities and communities of color.

About REACH

The Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help strives to improve the quality of life for families and people of color in rural eastern North Carolina. In particular, REACH addresses social, economic and environmental issues through its environmental awareness, sustainable agriculture, small business development, and homeownership programs.

About WATERKEEPER® Alliance

Founded in 1999 by environmental attorney and activist Robert F. Kennedy, Jr. and several veteran Waterkeeper Organizations, Waterkeeper Alliance is a global movement of on-the-water advocates who patrol and protect over 1.5 million square miles of rivers, streams and coastlines in North and South America, Europe, Australia, Asia and Africa. Learn more at: www.waterkeeper.org or follow @Waterkeeper on Twitter and Facebook.

About Earthjustice

Earthjustice, the nation's premier nonprofit environmental law organization, wields the power of law and the strength of partnership to protect people's health, to preserve magnificent places and wildlife, to advance clean energy and to combat climate change.

Because the earth needs a good lawyer.

To: HALIM-CHESTNUT, NAIMA[Halim-Chestnut.Naima@epa.gov]
Cc: Mckinley, Lisa[McKinley.Lisa@epa.gov]; Bailey, Rhonda[Bailey.Rhonda@epa.gov]; Lapierre, Kenneth[Lapierre.Kenneth@epa.gov]; Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Covington, Jeryl[Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov]; Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]; Gsell, Alyssa[Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov]
From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Wed 8/27/2014 4:26:15 PM
Subject: Re: URGENT: Call from Earthjustice

Thanks for the email. I have copied Velveta and OGC on this message.

Let me talk with Velveta and OGC on approach because as you know we are communicating with OCR HQ on a number of fronts, including stakeholder engagement. Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Can we touch base with you/region by COB?

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Acting Deputy Director
Office of Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Aug 27, 2014, at 12:13 PM, "HALIM-CHESTNUT, NAIMA" <Halim-Chestnut.Naima@epa.gov> wrote:

<image001.gif>
Helena

I received a call from MaryAnne Engelman-Lado, 212-845-7393 from EarthJustice today and she is interested in filing a complaint against the NC DNR for perceived violations of Title VI for issuing a state swine permit that will certify 200 swine facilities in NC. They do not know the locations of all of the facilities but they do know that many of them will be in disadvantaged communities based on disproportionate data for communities in NC. They plan to file by this Thursday.

They are interested in speaking with Region 4 (and HQ) personally about their approach, as well as having us tour facilities. I wanted to get your take on what we should tell them and who you want to speak with them from this point forward?

I am including the Regional OCR team for their awareness.

Thank you.

Naima Halim-Chestnut, MAOM

Human Resources Officer, Acting

Human Capital Management Branch

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4

61 Forsyth Street SW

Atlanta, GA 30303

Office: 404-562-9220

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Email: halim-chestnut.naima@epa.gov

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Fri 2/6/2015 1:55:26 PM
Subject: Re: RESPONSE _ NC CAFO Drone Video Briefing

I have idea. There is supposed to be 1 meeting. The meeting is about Marianne's interest in getting updates on her cases.

I asked Cheryl to talk to you first before she scheduled anything.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)
Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy
wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

> On Feb 6, 2015, at 8:52 AM, "Golightly-Howell, Velveta" <Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov> wrote:
>
> Hi Helena. Why are two meetings scheduled with Marianne, back-to-back? I can't tell how they differ. Is one in response to her meeting request and the other to provide her an opportunity to do a briefing?
>
> Velveta
>
> -----Original Message-----
> From: Marianne Engelman Lado [mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org]
> Sent: Thursday, February 05, 2015 4:22 PM
> To: Whickum, Cheryl
> Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
> Subject: [SPAM] Re: RESPONSE _ NC CAFO Drone Video Briefing
>
> The 17th works and I accepted the calendar invite. I have a conflict on the 18th but may be able to make it work with advance notice.
>
> Thanks,
>
> Marianne
>
> Sent from my iPhone. Please excuse any errors.
>
> On Feb 5, 2015, at 12:18 PM, "Whickum, Cheryl"
> <Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov<mailto:Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov>> wrote:
>
> A Warm & Hearty...
> Ms. Helena:
>
> Per your request, the above has been "tentatively" scheduled for 2/17 or 2/18.
> My apologies that Ms. Velveta's schedule for the rest of this month is booked, otherwise.
>
> Thank you,
>
>
> _____
> Cheryl Whickum
> U. S. EPA

> Office of Civil Rights
> 1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
> WJC-North, Rm 2450, Mail Code: 1201A
> Washington, DC 20460
> 202-564-4366 (Direct Line)
> 202-564-7272 (Office Line)
> 202-501-1836 (Fax Line)

>
>
>
>
> From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
> Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 5:47 PM
> To: Marianne Engelman Lado
> Cc: Whickum, Cheryl; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
> Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

>
> Great. We will be in contact regarding scheduling ASAP. Talk to you soon and have a good weekend

>
> Helena Wooden-Aguilar
> Assistant Director
> External Civil Rights - US EPA
> 202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

> wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>

>
>
> On Jan 9, 2015, at 2:09 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
> Many thanks. It'd be great if we could get something on the schedule soon.

>
> Thanks again,

>
> Marianne

>
> From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
> Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 8:36 AM
> To: Marianne Engelman Lado; Whickum, Cheryl
> Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
> Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

>
> Hi Marianne

>
> Happy New Year to you! The Director's scheduler is Cheryl Whickum and she will be in contact with you
ASAP regarding setting up a meeting. Cheryl is on email.

>
> Thanks for checking in and we will talk soon.

>
> Helena

>
>
> Helena Wooden-Aguilar
> Assistant Director
> External Civil Rights - US EPA
> 202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

> wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>
>
>
> On Jan 8, 2015, at 6:48 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
> Helena,
>
> Happy New Year.
>
> I remain eager to touch base on the status of the complaints. At this point, I'm open in the morning tomorrow, or we can schedule something for next week. I was hoping at least to touch base, and perhaps the two of us might talk if it's hard to juggle additional schedules.
>
> Best,
>
> Marianne
>
> From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
> Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:46 PM
> To: Marianne Engelman Lado
> Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
> Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video
>
> Great. I will coordinate the calendars and email you. I think the 9th is a possible option as the Director will be returning to the office on the 8th of January.
>
> Happy Holidays to you.
>
> Helena
>
> Helena Wooden-Aguilar
> Assistant Director
> External Civil Rights - US EPA
> 202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

> wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>
>
>
> On Dec 19, 2014, at 2:41 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
> Yes, that'd be fine.
>
> To get the ball rolling, my calendar is currently open on Tuesday the 6th after 3:30, on Wednesday the 7th, between 3 and 4:30, on Thursday the 8th after 4, and on Friday the 9th until 1 pm. I assume you'll want Monday the 5th to catch up!
>
> It doesn't have to be during this same phone call, but I'd also like to touch base on the request for a meeting with the Administrator on Title VI issues more broadly, if you have any additional information or can be helpful.
>
> I hope you're having a wonderful vacation and I look forward to speaking in the new year.
>
> Best,
>
> Marianne
>

> From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
> Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:38 PM
> To: Marianne Engelman Lado
> Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
> Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video
>
> Marianne,
>
> Thank you for your email. I am on vacation now and will not be back in the office until after the 5th of January. Can we look at calendars after the new year?

>
>
>
> Helena
>
> Helena Wooden-Aguilar
> Assistant Director
> External Civil Rights - US EPA
> 202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

> wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>
>
>
> On Dec 18, 2014, at 10:24 AM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:

> Helena,
>
> I was hoping to touch base with you on the status of the jurisdictional determination in the North Carolina swine permit case, as well as the investigation into Alabama's permit of the Arrowhead landfill. Do you have time for a quick call this week? Or can we put something on the calendar for the first week in January?

>
> In the meantime, I thought you and others working on the North Carolina swine permit case might find new video footage taken of swine facilities in North Carolina – and particularly the lagoons of manure – of interest. The video features both Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy and Steve Wing, who submitted declarations that are attached to our complaint, as well as Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process/Atty Client who has also given us a statement that we plan to submit moving forward. See <http://FactoryFarmDrones.com>. The videographer was also interviewed in a piece that just came out in Salon.com<<http://Salon.com>> at http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_modern_american_farming.

>
> Many thanks for your attention to these matters.
>
> I hope that you have a wonderful holiday and I look forward to hearing from you.
>
> Best,

>
> Marianne
>
>
> Marianne Engelman Lado
> Managing Attorney, Northeast Office
> Earthjustice
> 48 Wall Street, 19th Floor
> New York, NY 10005
> T: 212.845.7393

> F: 212.918.1556
> earthjustice.org<<http://www.earthjustice.org/>>
>
> <image001.gif>
>
> The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.
> If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.
> If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and delete the message and any attachments.
>
>
>

To: Whickum, Cheryl[Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov]
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
From: Marianne Engelman Lado
Sent: Thur 2/5/2015 9:22:29 PM
Subject: [SPAM] Re: RESPONSE _ NC CAFO Drone Video Briefing

The 17th works and I accepted the calendar invite. I have a conflict on the 18th but may be able to make it work with advance notice.

Thanks,

Marianne

Sent from my iPhone. Please excuse any errors.

On Feb 5, 2015, at 12:18 PM, "Whickum, Cheryl"
<Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov<mailto:Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov>> wrote:

A Warm & Hearty...
Ms. Helena:

Per your request, the above has been "tentatively" scheduled for 2/17 or 2/18.
My apologies that Ms. Velveta's schedule for the rest of this month is booked, otherwise.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum
U. S. EPA
Office of Civil Rights
1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
WJC-North, Rm 2450, Mail Code: 1201A
Washington, DC 20460
202-564-4366 (Direct Line)
202-564-7272 (Office Line)
202-501-1836 (Fax Line)

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 5:47 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Whickum, Cheryl; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Great. We will be in contact regarding scheduling ASAP. Talk to you soon and have a good weekend

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>

On Jan 9, 2015, at 2:09 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
Many thanks. It'd be great if we could get something on the schedule soon.

Thanks again,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 8:36 AM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado; Whickum, Cheryl
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Hi Marianne

Happy New Year to you! The Director's scheduler is Cheryl Whickum and she will be in contact with you ASAP regarding setting up a meeting. Cheryl is on email.

Thanks for checking in and we will talk soon.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>

On Jan 8, 2015, at 6:48 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
Helena,

Happy New Year.

I remain eager to touch base on the status of the complaints. At this point, I'm open in the morning tomorrow, or we can schedule something for next week. I was hoping at least to touch base, and perhaps the two of us might talk if it's hard to juggle additional schedules.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:46 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Great. I will coordinate the calendars and email you. I think the 9th is a possible option as the Director will be returning to the office on the 8th of January.

Happy Holidays to you.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>

On Dec 19, 2014, at 2:41 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
Yes, that'd be fine.

To get the ball rolling, my calendar is currently open on Tuesday the 6th after 3:30, on Wednesday the 7th, between 3 and 4:30, on Thursday the 8th after 4, and on Friday the 9th until 1 pm. I assume you'll want Monday the 5th to catch up!

It doesn't have to be during this same phone call, but I'd also like to touch base on the request for a meeting with the Administrator on Title VI issues more broadly, if you have any additional information or can be helpful.

I hope you're having a wonderful vacation and I look forward to speaking in the new year.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:38 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Marianne,

Thank you for your email. I am on vacation now and will not be back in the office until after the 5th of January. Can we look at calendars after the new year?

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov<mailto:wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov>

On Dec 18, 2014, at 10:24 AM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>> wrote:
Helena,

I was hoping to touch base with you on the status of the jurisdictional determination in the North Carolina swine permit case, as well as the investigation into Alabama's permit of the Arrowhead landfill. Do you have time for a quick call this week? Or can we put something on the calendar for the first week in January?

In the meantime, I thought you and others working on the North Carolina swine permit case might find new video footage taken of swine facilities in North Carolina – and particularly the lagoons of manure – of interest. The video features both Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process/Atty Client and Steve Wing, who submitted declarations that are attached to our complaint, as well as Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process/Atty Client who has also given us a statement that we plan to submit moving forward. See <http://FactoryFarmDrones.com>. The videographer was also interviewed in a piece that just came out in Salon.com<<http://Salon.com>> at http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_modern_american_farming.

Many thanks for your attention to these matters.

I hope that you have a wonderful holiday and I look forward to hearing from you.

Best,

Marianne

Marianne Engelman Lado
Managing Attorney, Northeast Office
Earthjustice
48 Wall Street, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10005
T: 212.845.7393
F: 212.918.1556
[earthjustice.org](http://www.earthjustice.org)<<http://www.earthjustice.org>>

<image001.gif>

The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.

If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.

If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and delete the message and any attachments.

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Marianne Engelman Lado[mengelmannlado@earthjustice.org]
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
From: Whickum, Cheryl
Sent: Thur 2/5/2015 8:18:46 PM
Subject: RESPONSE _ NC CAFO Drone Video Briefing

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Helena:

Per your request, the above has been "tentatively" scheduled for 2/17 or 2/18.

My apologies that Ms. Velveta's schedule for the rest of this month is booked, otherwise.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA

Office of Civil Rights

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW

WJC-North, Rm 2450, Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-501-1836 (Fax Line)

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 5:47 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Whickum, Cheryl; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Great. We will be in contact regarding scheduling ASAP. Talk to you soon and have a good weekend

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Jan 9, 2015, at 2:09 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado" <mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Many thanks. It'd be great if we could get something on the schedule soon.

Thanks again,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]
Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 8:36 AM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado; Whickum, Cheryl
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Hi Marianne

Happy New Year to you! The Director's scheduler is Cheryl Whickum and she will be in contact with you ASAP regarding setting up a meeting. Cheryl is on email.

Thanks for checking in and we will talk soon.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Jan 8, 2015, at 6:48 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Helena,

Happy New Year.

I remain eager to touch base on the status of the complaints. At this point, I'm open in the morning tomorrow, or we can schedule something for next week. I was hoping at least to touch base, and perhaps the two of us might talk if it's hard to juggle additional schedules.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]
Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:46 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Great. I will coordinate the calendars and email you. I think the 9th is a possible option as the Director will be returning to the office on the 8th of January.

Happy Holidays to you.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Dec 19, 2014, at 2:41 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Yes, that'd be fine.

To get the ball rolling, my calendar is currently open on Tuesday the 6th after

3:30, on Wednesday the 7th, between 3 and 4:30, on Thursday the 8th after 4, and on Friday the 9th until 1 pm. I assume you'll want Monday the 5th to catch up!

It doesn't have to be during this same phone call, but I'd also like to touch base on the request for a meeting with the Administrator on Title VI issues more broadly, if you have any additional information or can be helpful.

I hope you're having a wonderful vacation and I look forward to speaking in the new year.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]
Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:38 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Marianne,

Thank you for your email. I am on vacation now and will not be back in the office until after the 5th of January. Can we look at calendars after the new year?

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Dec 18, 2014, at 10:24 AM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Helena,

I was hoping to touch base with you on the status of the jurisdictional determination in the North Carolina swine permit case, as well as the investigation into Alabama's permit of the Arrowhead landfill. Do you have time for a quick call this week? Or can we put something on the calendar for the first week in January?

In the meantime, I thought you and others working on the North Carolina swine permit case might find new video footage taken of swine facilities in North Carolina – and particularly the lagoons of manure – of interest. The video features both **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** and Steve Wing, who submitted declarations that are attached to our complaint, as well as **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** who has also given us a statement that we plan to submit moving forward. See <http://FactoryFarmDrones.com>. The videographer was also interviewed in a piece that just came out in [Salon.com](http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_n) at http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_n

Many thanks for your attention to these matters.

I hope that you have a wonderful holiday and I look forward to hearing from you.

Best,

Marianne

Marianne Engelman Lado

Managing Attorney, Northeast Office

Earthjustice

48 Wall Street, 19th Floor

New York, NY 10005

T: 212.845.7393

F: 212.918.1556

earthjustice.org

<image001.gif>

The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.

If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.

If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and

delete the message and any attachments.

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: Covington, Jeryl
Sent: Mon 3/2/2015 3:14:13 PM
Subject: FW: FYI - 2 non-AP stories about REACH
Inside EPA 2015.02.26.docx

Per your request, attached are two (2) media reports related to the REACH Title VI case. These article are reported in "The State" in South Carolina and "Inside EPA".

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Monday, March 02, 2015 7:58 AM
To: Colaizzi, Jennifer C.; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Dorka, Lilian; Matthew, Dayna
Cc: Rhodes, Julia; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Moffa, Anthony; Tommelleo, Nancy
Subject: FYI - 2 non-AP stories about REACH

http://www.thestate.com/2015/02/26/4012725_epa-to-probe-whether-nc-hog-farms.html?rh=1

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]
Cc: O'Lone.Mary@epa.gov[O'Lone.Mary@epa.gov]; Lareau, Alyssa (CRT)[Alyssa.Lareau@usdoj.gov]; Packard, Elise[Packard.Elise@epa.gov]; Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT)[Ryan.Fitzpatrick2@usdoj.gov]
From: Neal, Daria (CRT)
Sent: Thur 10/23/2014 9:23:59 PM
Subject: RE: REACH, Inc. (Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964)

Hello Velveta, Helena, and Julia.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client

Thanks.

Best,

Daria

Daria E. Neal

Deputy Chief

Federal Coordination and Compliance Section

Civil Rights Division

United States Department of Justice

Email: daria.neal@usdoj.gov

Tel: (202) 305-3346

Fax: (202) 307-0595

Follow the Civil Rights Division on Twitter: [@CivilRights](#)

Sign up [here](#) for our Title VI Newsletter, and read past issues [here](#).

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta [mailto:Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, September 26, 2014 6:36 PM
To: Neal, Daria (CRT)
Cc: Jang, Deeana (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT); Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone.Mary@epa.gov; Lareau, Alyssa (CRT); Packard, Elise
Subject: REACH, Inc. (Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964)

Thank you Daria. We'll follow up to reply to assistance ASAP.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client

Velveta

From: Neal, Daria (CRT) [mailto:Daria.Neal@usdoj.gov]
Sent: Friday, September 26, 2014 6:09 PM
To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Lareau, Alyssa (CRT)
Cc: Jang, Deeana (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT); Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone.Mary@epa.gov
Subject: RE: REACH, Inc. (Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964)

Hi Velveta,

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client

Have a good weekend.

Daria

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta [<mailto:Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov>]

Sent: Wednesday, September 24, 2014 8:38 PM

To: Lareau, Alyssa (CRT); Neal, Daria (CRT)

Cc: Jang, Deeana (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT); Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone.Mary@epa.gov

Subject: REACH, Inc. (Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964)

Hi Alyssa and Daria. We appreciated your and Ryan meeting with us today. Daria, in response to my question, Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client We want to ensure that none were missed. Would you please send Helena and me a list of them and copy Julia and Mary? As she said, Helena will forward the info you requested ASAP. Bye everyone.

Velveta

From: Lareau, Alyssa (CRT) <Alyssa.Lareau@usdoj.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, September 23, 2014 2:51:39 PM
To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Neal, Daria (CRT)
Cc: Jang, Decana (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT); Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: RE: Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964

All,

We are looking forward to our phone discussion at noon tomorrow. Let's use the following call in information:

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Let me know if you have any questions.

Alyssa

Alyssa C. Lareau

Attorney

Federal Coordination and Compliance Section

U.S. Department of Justice - Civil Rights Division

Direct: (202) 305-2994 [voice]

alyssa.lareau@usdoj.gov

<http://www.justice.gov/crt/about/cor/>

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta [<mailto:Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov>]
Sent: Monday, September 22, 2014 5:28 PM
To: Neal, Daria (CRT)
Cc: Jang, Deeana (CRT); Lareau, Alyssa (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT); Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: RE: Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964

Hi Daria. While I'd welcome the opportunity to sit down with you all, I have a meeting with a regional official that's not scheduled to end until noon on the 24th. Take care.

Velveta

Velveta Golightly-Howell
Director, Office of Civil Rights
Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Mail Code 1201A
Washington, DC 20460
202-564-6685

From: Neal, Daria (CRT) [<mailto:Daria.Neal@usdoj.gov>]

Sent: Monday, September 22, 2014 5:20 PM

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Jang, Deeana (CRT); Lareau, Alyssa (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT)

Subject: RE: Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964

Hi Helena,

That works well for us. Would you prefer to meet in person or by phone? We can come to your office.

Daria

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]

Sent: Monday, September 22, 2014 3:08 PM

To: Neal, Daria (CRT)

Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Jang, Deeana (CRT); Lareau, Alyssa (CRT); Fitzpatrick, Ryan (CRT)

Subject: Re: Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964

Hi Daria

I am working on scheduling this meeting. How does the 24th at noon work for you and others at Justice?

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Sep 18, 2014, at 12:49 PM, "Neal, Daria (CRT)" <Daria.Neal@usdoj.gov> wrote:

Hi Velveta and Helena,

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client

Can you let us know some dates over the next two weeks that you are available to meet?

Also, we are missing some parts of the exhibits. If you have the following, can you please email them to us.:

- Vol I - Exs 1-26. The pdf stopped at Ex 6, sub-exhibit 11 (We have Ex. 6, the Declaration of Larry Baldwin and sub-exhibits 1-11 of that Declaration but not sub-exhibits 12-17 of that declaration). We are missing Exhibits 7-26 in their entirety.
- Ex 39 documents are very blurry. Did you all receive a clear copy?

Thank you so much.

Daria

From: Jocelyn D'Ambrosio [<mailto:jdambrosio@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Wednesday, September 03, 2014 6:39 PM
To: 'mccarthy.gina@epa.gov'; 'Title_VI_Complaints@epa.gov'
Cc: 'wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov'; 'Tejada.matthew@epa.gov'; 'McTeertoney.heather@Epa.gov'; 'Halim-Chestnut.naima@Epa.gov'; Neal, Daria (CRT); 'tom.reeder@ncdenr.gov'; 'christine.lawson@ncdenr.gov'; 'naeema1951@gmail.com;

'dihall7@aol.com'; 'lbaldwin@waterkeeper.org'

Subject: Complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964

Dear Administrator McCarthy and Ms. Golightly-Howell,

On March 7, 2014, the North Carolina Department of Environment and Natural Resources ("DENR") issued a general permit that allows industrial swine facilities in North Carolina to operate with grossly inadequate and outdated systems of controlling animal waste and little provision for government oversight, which has an unjustified disproportionate impact on the basis of race and national origin against African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans in violation of Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and EPA's implementing regulations.

North Carolina Environmental Justice Network, Rural Empowerment Association for Community Help, and Waterkeeper Alliance, Inc. ("Complainants") hereby submit the attached complaint against DENR and request that EPA investigate the complaint and require that DENR come into compliance with the law.

As you may know, Complainants and other community members in eastern North Carolina have complained to DENR about the adverse effects of the swine industry on their health and environment for years, to no avail. Today, Complainants ask that EPA take action.

We will be forwarding exhibits by separate email and, also, sending hard copies overnight by Federal Express to each of your offices. Of course, please let us know if these materials raise any question. We would welcome the opportunity to discuss the complaint.

Sincerely,

Jocelyn D'Ambrosio and Marianne Engelman Lado

Jocelyn D'Ambrosio

Associate Attorney

Earthjustice Northeast Office

48 Wall Street, 19th Floor
New York, New York 10005
T: 212-845-7385
F: 212-918-1556
earthjustice.org

<image001.gif>

The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.

If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.

If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and delete the message and any attachments.

To: KeyesFleming, Gwendolyn[KeyesFleming.Gwendolyn@epa.gov]
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Reeder, John[Reeder.John@epa.gov]; Packard, Elise[Packard.Elise@epa.gov]; Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]
From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Thur 10/23/2014 9:03:31 PM
Subject: Re: REACH, Inc. - Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs

Thanks. OCR will keep you updated.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Oct 23, 2014, at 4:46 PM, "KeyesFleming, Gwendolyn"
<KeyesFleming.Gwendolyn@epa.gov> wrote:

The response is fine. I'm sure it's gone out by now & we should be prepared for more questions re: our timing

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Sent: Wednesday, October 22, 2014 3:42 PM
To: KeyesFleming, Gwendolyn; Reeder, John
Cc: Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: REACH, Inc. - Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs
Importance: High

Hi Gwen and John. We wanted to alert you to the media inquiry received re: the REACH complaint. Below is the OGC-cleared response that will be sent to Jennifer Colaizzi who's handling the inquiry. Below it, is info on the press inquiry. Please let Helena or me know if you have any questions. Thanks.

Velveta

The Office of Civil Rights received the complaint via email September 3, 2014 and by mail September 5, 2014. EPA is currently conducting a review to determine whether it has jurisdiction to investigate the complaint.

From: Colaizzi, Jennifer C.
Sent: Tuesday, October 21, 2014 4:11 PM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: Fwd: Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs

Is this pertaining to your office?

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Carey Biron <cbiron@mintpressnews.com>
Date: October 21, 2014 at 3:55:15 PM EDT
To: "Colaizzi, Jennifer C." <colaizzi.jennifer@epa.gov>
Subject: Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs

Greetings Jennifer:

I hope you're doing very well. I'm planning to write tomorrow on the Title VI complaint recently filed by groups in North Carolina around industrial hog farms in the eastern part of the state. I'm wondering whether you can confirm receipt of this complaint and whether you can offer any update on EPA's consideration of this case.

I'll be filing this story by around 3:00 on Wednesday, and look forward to hearing from you. Thanks!

--

Carey L Biron

Washington correspondent

Mint Press News

cbiron@mintpressnews.com

Office: 202-662-7161

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

mintpressnews.com

This email message (including attachments) contains information which may be confidential and/or legally privileged. Unless you are the intended recipient, you may not use, copy or disclose to anyone the message or any information contained in the message or from any attachments that were sent with this email, and If you have received this email message in error, please advise the sender by email, and delete the message. Unauthorized disclosure and/or use of information contained in this email may result in civil and criminal liability.

The e-mail address of the sender may not be used, copied, sold, disclosed or incorporated into any database or mailing list for spamming and/or other marketing purposes without the prior consent of Internet Solutions.

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Reeder, John[Reeder.John@epa.gov]
Cc: Packard, Elise[Packard.Elise@epa.gov]; Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: KeyesFleming, Gwendolyn
Sent: Thur 10/23/2014 8:46:22 PM
Subject: RE: REACH, Inc. - Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs

The response is fine. I'm sure it's gone out by now & we should be prepared for more questions re: our timing

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Sent: Wednesday, October 22, 2014 3:42 PM
To: KeyesFleming, Gwendolyn; Reeder, John
Cc: Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: REACH, Inc. - Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs
Importance: High

Hi Gwen and John. We wanted to alert you to the media inquiry received re: the REACH complaint. Below is the OGC-cleared response that will be sent to Jennifer Colaizzi who's handling the inquiry. Below it, is info on the press inquiry. Please let Helena or me know if you have any questions. Thanks.

Velveta

The Office of Civil Rights received the complaint via email September 3, 2014 and by mail September 5, 2014. EPA is currently conducting a review to determine whether it has jurisdiction to investigate the complaint.

From: Colaizzi, Jennifer C.
Sent: Tuesday, October 21, 2014 4:11 PM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: Fwd: Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs

Is this pertaining to your office?

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Carey Biron <cbiron@mintpressnews.com>
Date: October 21, 2014 at 3:55:15 PM EDT
To: "Colaizzi, Jennifer C." <colaizzi.jennifer@epa.gov>
Subject: Media query: Title VI/North Carolina CAFOs

Greetings Jennifer:

I hope you're doing very well. I'm planning to write tomorrow on the Title VI complaint recently filed by groups in North Carolina around industrial hog farms in the eastern part of the state. I'm wondering whether you can confirm receipt of this complaint and whether you can offer any update on EPA's consideration of this case.

I'll be filing this story by around 3:00 on Wednesday, and look forward to hearing from you. Thanks!

--

Carey L Biron

Washington correspondent

Mint Press News

cbiron@mintpressnews.com

Office: 202-662-7161

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

mintpressnews.com

This email message (including attachments) contains information which may be confidential and/or legally privileged. Unless you are the intended recipient, you may not use, copy or disclose to anyone the message or any information contained in the message or from any attachments that were sent with this email, and If you have received this email message in error, please advise the sender by email, and delete the message. Unauthorized disclosure and/or use of information contained in this email may result in civil and criminal liability.

The e-mail address of the sender may not be used, copied, sold, disclosed or incorporated into any database or mailing list for spamming and/or other marketing purposes without the prior consent of Internet Solutions.

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
Cc: Matthew, Dayna[Matthew.Dayna@epa.gov]; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Mon 2/2/2015 1:01:45 PM
Subject: Re: REACH - FYI -- news re: CAFOs

sorry about that -- so do I.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Atty Client

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Sent: Saturday, January 31, 2015 5:19 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Cc: Matthew, Dayna
Subject: REACH - FYI -- news re: CAFOs

Thanks Mary. I look forward to hearing what the studies indicate in layman's terms.

Velveta

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Friday, January 30, 2015 1:10:48 PM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Dorka, Lilian; Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Matthew, Dayna
Cc: Moffa, Anthony; Rhodes, Julia; Packard, Elise; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka

Subject: FYI -- news re: CAFOs

All-

Another study has been published regarding health effects of swine CAFOs in NC. (See attached). According to the article study used air modelling to estimate ammonia concentrations at locations downwind of swine CAFOs and to evaluate the disproportionate exposure of children, elderly, whites and minorities to the pollutant in one NC watershed. "Ammonia is one of the gases emitted by swine CAFOs and could affect human health. . . . Our results show that the average ammonia concentrations in hot spots for 2000 and 2010 were 2.5–3-times higher than the average concentration in the entire watershed." Later article summarizes results by saying: ". . . areas with high ammonia concentrations are surrounded by areas with high numbers of vulnerable population. Although the population in three vulnerable groups within hot spots has slightly decreased between the two years, the number of people disproportionately exposed to ammonia concentrations was still large in 2010: 2444 children, 1288 elderly people, 9537 whites and 3915 minorities."

The article also provides a critique of some of the studies submitted by REACH or discussed in the complaint & says that it has attempted to address the shortcomings of those studies: "One of the limitations of these studies is that CAFO characteristics (the number of facilities or the number of hogs) are used as a surrogate measure of potential pollution produced by CAFOs. Our study tries to address this gap in the literature and uses modeled pollutant concentrations in the air as a measure of population exposure."

Also, EPA was sued earlier this week for failing to set a NAAQS for ammonia & the plaintiffs are specifically concerned about the ammonia emissions from CAFOs.

According to the news article: "The groups filed petitions in 2009 and 2011 asking the agency to set national ambient air quality standards for ammonia. When nitrogen from manure decomposes, it releases several gases, one of which is ammonia. Ammonia can volatilize, and when it does, it's harmful to farm laborers, birds and the neighboring homes. The agency didn't respond to the petitions, and the groups felt it had had enough time to do so. The legal action asks the courts to compel the EPA to address the petitions. If the EPA agrees to address the petitions and then finds them without merit, the groups say, they will file further legal action."

http://www.bayjournal.com/blog/post/epa_sued_over_inaction_on_factory_farm_air_pollution
(Thanks to Dan Isales for flagging this article for me). I have sent an email to the OGC ARLO attorney who works NAAQS issues to find out more about the lawsuit.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
From: Hall, William
Sent: Wed 9/2/2015 7:17:54 PM
Subject: FW: REACH - Title VI CAFO-related Complaint

Velveta,

You and OCR are all welcome. Glad to help. I'm working with contractor now to keep the process moving forward.

BTW, I noticed that this email appears to inadvertently have been sent to one of the CalEPA folks.

Will

William E. Hall, Ph.D.
Conflict Prevention and Resolution Center
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
"Making Agreement Easier" | (202) 564-0214
<http://intranet.epa.gov/adr> or <http://www.epa.gov/adr>

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Sent: Wednesday, September 02, 2015 3:13 PM
To: Fritz, Matthew; Pieh, Luseni; Shapiro, Mike; Lapierre, Kenneth; Tellis, Vickie; Heard, Anne; Shaw, Betsy; Tommelleo, Nancy; Jones, Kim A; Reynolds, Alice@EPA; Rupp, Mark; Vaught, Laura; Ali, Mustafa; Tejada, Matthew; Lee, Charles; Smith, Roxanne; Hull, George; Abrams, Dan; Garbow, Avi; Shenkman, Ethan; Minoli, Kevin; Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Carleton, Ron
Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Covington, Jeryl; Temple, Kurt; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Farrell, Ericka; Hall, William
Subject: REACH - Title VI CAFO-related Complaint

Hello everyone. Will Hall of the ADR Office has let us know that the parties

have agreed to a mediator. As you may recall, the selection process started this past spring and it has taken months. We, however, thank Will for his exceptional work and patience in working the parties through the process. If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact Lilian, Jeryl or me. Have a wonderful Labor Day weekend everyone!

Velveta

Velveta Golightly-Howell

Director, Office of Civil Rights

Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Mail Code 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-7272

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Whickum, Cheryl[Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov]
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Whickum, Cheryl[Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov]
From: Marianne Engelman Lado
Sent: Fri 1/9/2015 7:09:32 PM
Subject: RE: NC CAFO drone video

Many thanks. It'd be great if we could get something on the schedule soon.

Thanks again,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, January 09, 2015 8:36 AM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado; Whickum, Cheryl
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Hi Marianne

Happy New Year to you! The Director's scheduler is Cheryl Whickum and she will be in contact with you ASAP regarding setting up a meeting. Cheryl is on email.

Thanks for checking in and we will talk soon.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Jan 8, 2015, at 6:48 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado" <mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Helena,

Happy New Year.

I remain eager to touch base on the status of the complaints. At this point, I'm open in the morning tomorrow, or we can schedule something for next week. I was hoping at least to touch base, and perhaps the two of us might talk if it's hard to juggle additional schedules.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:46 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Great. I will coordinate the calendars and email you. I think the 9th is a possible option as the Director will be returning to the office on the 8th of January.

Happy Holidays to you.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Dec 19, 2014, at 2:41 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"

<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Yes, that'd be fine.

To get the ball rolling, my calendar is currently open on Tuesday the 6th after 3:30, on Wednesday the 7th, between 3 and 4:30, on Thursday the 8th after 4, and on Friday the 9th until 1 pm. I assume you'll want Monday the 5th to catch up!

It doesn't have to be during this same phone call, but I'd also like to touch base on the request for a meeting with the Administrator on Title VI issues more broadly, if you have any additional information or can be helpful.

I hope you're having a wonderful vacation and I look forward to speaking in the new year.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]

Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:38 PM

To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Marianne,

Thank you for your email. I am on vacation now and will not be back in the office until after the 5th of January. Can we look at calendars after the new year?

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Dec 18, 2014, at 10:24 AM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Helena,

I was hoping to touch base with you on the status of the jurisdictional determination in the North Carolina swine permit case, as well as the investigation into Alabama's permit of the Arrowhead landfill. Do you have time for a quick call this week? Or can we put something on the calendar for the first week in January?

In the meantime, I thought you and others working on the North Carolina swine permit case might find new video footage taken of swine facilities in North Carolina – and particularly the lagoons of manure – of interest. The video features both Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy and Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy who submitted declarations that are attached to our complaint, as well as Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy who has also given us a statement that we plan to submit moving forward. See <http://FactoryFarmDrones.com>. The videographer was also interviewed in a piece that just came out in [Salon.com](http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_moo) at http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_moo

Many thanks for your attention to these matters.

I hope that you have a wonderful holiday and I look forward to hearing from you.

Best,

Marianne

Marianne Engelman Lado

Managing Attorney, Northeast Office

Earthjustice

48 Wall Street, 19th Floor

New York, NY 10005

T: 212.845.7393

F: 212.918.1556

earthjustice.org

<image001.gif>

The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.

If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.

If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and delete the message and any attachments.

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Whickum, Cheryl[Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov]
From: Marianne Engelman Lado
Sent: Thur 1/8/2015 11:48:35 PM
Subject: RE: NC CAFO drone video

Helena,

Happy New Year.

I remain eager to touch base on the status of the complaints. At this point, I'm open in the morning tomorrow, or we can schedule something for next week. I was hoping at least to touch base, and perhaps the two of us might talk if it's hard to juggle additional schedules.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:46 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Whickum, Cheryl
Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Great. I will coordinate the calendars and email you. I think the 9th is a possible option as the Director will be returning to the office on the 8th of January.

Happy Holidays to you.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Dec 19, 2014, at 2:41 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado" <mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Yes, that'd be fine.

To get the ball rolling, my calendar is currently open on Tuesday the 6th after 3:30, on Wednesday the 7th, between 3 and 4:30, on Thursday the 8th after 4, and on Friday the 9th until 1 pm. I assume you'll want Monday the 5th to catch up!

It doesn't have to be during this same phone call, but I'd also like to touch base on the request for a meeting with the Administrator on Title VI issues more broadly, if you have any additional information or can be helpful.

I hope you're having a wonderful vacation and I look forward to speaking in the new year.

Best,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]

Sent: Friday, December 19, 2014 2:38 PM

To: Marianne Engelman Lado

Cc: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Subject: Re: NC CAFO drone video

Marianne,

Thank you for your email. I am on vacation now and will not be back in the office until after the 5th of January. Can we look at calendars after the new year?

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Dec 18, 2014, at 10:24 AM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Helena,

I was hoping to touch base with you on the status of the jurisdictional determination in the North Carolina swine permit case, as well as the investigation into Alabama's permit of the Arrowhead landfill. Do you have time for a quick call this week? Or can we put something on the calendar for the first week in January?

In the meantime, I thought you and others working on the North Carolina swine permit

case might find new video footage taken of swine facilities in North Carolina – and particularly the lagoons of manure – of interest. The video features both Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy and Steve Wind, who submitted declarations that are attached to our complaint, as well as Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy who has also given us a statement that we plan to submit moving forward. See <http://FactoryFarmDrones.com>. The videographer was also interviewed in a piece that just came out in [Salon.com](http://www.salon.com) at

http://www.salon.com/2014/12/17/open_air_cesspools_of_toxic_manure_the_disgusting_secrets_of_modern_farming

Many thanks for your attention to these matters.

I hope that you have a wonderful holiday and I look forward to hearing from you.

Best,

Marianne

Marianne Engelman Lado

Managing Attorney, Northeast Office

Earthjustice

48 Wall Street, 19th Floor

New York, NY 10005

T: 212.845.7393

F: 212.918.1556

earthjustice.org

<image001.gif>

The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.

If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.

If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and delete the message and any attachments.

To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Wed 3/9/2016 4:23:30 PM
Subject: Re: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

Velveta-

You may also want to let Mike Shapiro, Betsy Shaw, & Larry Starfield know too.

They were more involved than OEJ & Ron were.

Also, please ask them to confirm/send to me & Ericka the staff level contact for their office.

They sent you names about a year ago, but they may have changed.

I sent an email yesterday to the staff contacts from last year to give them a heads up & that is when I noticed you didn't have those DCROs on the email.

Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Sent: Monday, March 7, 2016 4:00 PM
To: Fritz, Matthew; Pieh, Lusen; Reeder, John; Lapierre, Kenneth; Purchia, Liz; Rupp, Mark; Carleton, Ron; Ali, Mustafa; Tejada, Matthew
Cc: Smith, Roxanne; Hall, William; Dorka, Lilian; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; Temple, Kurt; Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Harrell, Collette; Lee, Charles
Subject: EPA OCR Complaint 11R-14-R4 (ADR)

Hello Matt F., Lu, John, Ken, Liz, Mark, Ron, Mustafa and Matt T. I'm writing to let you know that this morning, Marianne Lado Engelman of Earthjustice, the lead representative for complainants contacted me regarding REACH. the Title VI discrimination complaint which alleges race and national origin discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Ms. Lado Engelman advised that the complainants have concluded that ADR is unproductive; they therefore request that OCR reinstate its investigation. In requesting recommencement of the investigation, Ms. Lado Engelman stated:

"Finally, we wanted to mention that our initial mediation session was interrupted by an effort by the National and North Carolina Pork Councils to interject themselves into the mediation process. Despite the terms of ADR, which included a requirement that mediation be confidential, and despite our clear opposition to their self-styled "motion to intervene" in the complaint and mediation process, five representatives from the Pork Council appeared without notice to Complainants at the first mediation session. Their presence and insistence at playing a role in mediation delayed the start of our session and acted as a form of intimidation of our clients. Representatives from DEQ failed to object to the behavior. Indeed, quite the opposite, they tried to persuade Complainants to consent to bringing the Pork Councils into mediation. We thought it was relevant and important to bring these events to your attention."

FYI, in response to the councils' request to intervene in ADR, in or about January, I notified the requesters that the parties would have to agree to include them and that OCR does not participate in ADR. Ms. Lado Engelman was copied on the response.

As ADR has ended, OCR will relaunch its complaint investigation. Please don't hesitate to let me know if you have any questions.

Velveta

Velveta Golightly-Howell

Director, Office of Civil Rights

Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Mail Code 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-7272

